76 Sandaka Sutta
To Sandaka

1. Thus have I heard: On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Kosambi in Gosaṅga’s Park.
2. Now on that occasion the wanderer Sandaka was staying in the Pāḷākkha-tree Cave with a large assembly of wanderers.
3. Then, when it was evening, the venerable Ānanda rose from meditation and addressed the bhikkhus thus: “Come, friends, let us go to the Devakāja Pool to see the cave.” — “Yes, friend,” those bhikkhus replied. Then the venerable Ānanda went to the Devakāja Pool together with a number of bhikkhus.
4. Now on that occasion the wanderer Sandaka was seated with a large assembly of wanderers who were making an uproar, loudly and noisily talking many kinds of pointless talk, such as talk of kings, robbers, ministers, armies, dangers, battles, food, drink, clothing, beds, garlands, perfumes, relatives, vehicles, villages, towns, cities, countries, men, women, heroes, streets, wells, the dead, trifes, the origin of the world, the origin of the sea, whether things are so or are not so. Then the wanderer Sandaka saw the venerable Ānanda coming in the distance. Seeing him, he quieted his own assembly thus: “Sirs, be quiet; sirs, make no noise. Here comes the recluse Ānanda, a disciple of the recluse Gotama, one of the recluse Gotama’s disciples staying in Kosambi. These venerable ones like quiet; they are disciplined in quiet; they commend quiet. Perhaps if he finds our assembly a quiet one, he will think to join us.” Then the wanderers became silent.
5. The venerable Ānanda went to the wanderer Sandaka who said to him: “Let Master Ānanda come! Welcome to Master Ānanda! It is long since Master Ānanda found an opportunity to come here. Let Master Ānanda be seated; this seat is ready.”

The venerable Ānanda sat down on the seat made ready, and the wanderer Sandaka took a low seat and sat down at one side. When he had done so, the venerable Ānanda asked him: “For what discussion are you sitting together here now, Sandaka? And what was your discussion that was left unfinished?”

“Master Ānanda, let be the discussion for which we are now sitting together here. Master Ānanda can well hear about it later. It would be good if Master Ānanda would give a talk on his own teacher’s Dhamma.”

“Then, Sandaka, listen and attend closely to what I shall say.”

“Yes, sir,” he replied. The venerable Ānanda said this:

6. “Sandaka, these four ways that negate the living of the holy life have been declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, accomplished and fully enlightened, and also these four kinds of holy life without consolation have been declared, wherein a wise man certainly would not live the holy life, or if he should live it, would not attain the true way, the Dhamma that is wholesome.”

7. “But, Master Ānanda, what are those four ways that negate the living of the holy life that have been declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, accomplished and fully enlightened, wherein a wise man certainly would not live the holy life, or if he should live it, would not attain the true way, the Dhamma that is wholesome?”

8. “Here, Sandaka, some teacher holds such a doctrine and view as this: There is nothing given, nothing offered, nothing sacrificed; no fruit or result of good and bad actions; no this world, no other world; no mother, no father; no beings who are reborn spontaneously; no good and virtuous recluse and brahmin in the world who have themselves realised by direct knowledge and declare this world and the other world. A person consists of the four great elements. When he dies, earth returns and goes back to the body of earth, water returns and goes back to the body of water, fire returns and goes back to the body of fire, air returns and goes back to the body of air; the faculties are transferred to space. Four men with the bier as fifth carry away the corpse. The funeral orations last as far as the charnel ground; the bones whiten; burnt offerings end with ashes. Giving is a doctrine of fools. When anyone asserts the
making others mutilate, torturing and making others inflict torture, because of this there would be no evil and no outcome of evil. If one were to go along the north bank of the Ganges giving gifts and making others give gifts, making offerings and making others make offerings, because of this there would be no merit and no outcome of merit. By giving, by taming oneself, by restraint, by speaking truth, there is no merit and no outcome of merit.”

11. “About this a wise man considers thus: ‘This good teacher holds this doctrine and view: “When one acts... there is no merit and no outcome of merit.” If this good teacher’s words are true, then here [in this teaching] I have done [my duty] by not doing [it], here I have lived [the holy life] by not living [it].’ Both of us are exactly equal here [in this teaching], both have arrived at equality, yet I do not say that both of us are cut off and annihilated with the dissolution of the body, that after death we shall not exist. But it is superfluous for this good teacher to go about naked, to be shaven, to exert himself in the squatting posture, and to pull out his hair and beard, since I, who live in a house crowded with children, who use Benares sandalwood, who wear garlands, scents, and unguents, and accept gold and silver, shall reap exactly the same destination, the same future course, as this good teacher. What do I know and see that I should lead the holy life under this teacher? So when he finds that this way negates the living of the holy life, he turns away from it and leaves it.

12. “This is the second way that negates the living of the holy life that has been declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, accomplished and fully enlightened.

13. “Again, Sandaka, here some teacher holds such a doctrine and view as this: ‘There is no cause or condition for the defilement of beings; beings are defiled without cause or condition. There is no cause or condition for the purification of beings; beings are purified without cause or condition. There is no power, no energy, no manly [517] strength, no manly endurance. All beings, all living things, all creatures, all souls are without mastery, power, and energy; moulded by destiny, circumstance, and nature, they experience pleasure and pain in the six classes.’

14. “About this a wise man considers thus: ‘This good teacher holds this doctrine and view: “There is no cause... in the six classes.” If this good teacher’s words are true, then here [in this teaching] I have done [my duty] by not doing [it], here I have lived [the holy life] by not living [it]. Both of us are exactly equal here [in this teaching], both have arrived at equality, yet I do not say that both [of us] will be purified without cause or condition. But it is superfluous for this good teacher... What do I know and
see that I should lead the holy life under this teacher? So when he finds that this way negates the living of the holy life, he turns away from it and leaves it.

15. "This is the third way that negates the living of the holy life that has been declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, accomplished and fully enlightened."

16. "Again, Sandaka, here some teacher holds such a doctrine and view as this: There are these seven bodies that are unmade, not brought forth, not uncreated, without a creator, barren, standing like mountain peaks, standing like pillars. They do not move or change or obstruct each other. None is able [to arouse] pleasure or pain or pleasure-and-pain in another. What are the seven? They are the earth-body, the water-body, the fire-body, the air-body, pleasure, pain, and the soul as the seventh. These seven bodies are unmade... Herein, there is no killer, no slayer, no hearer, no speaker, no cognizer, no intimater. Even those who cut off someone’s head with a sharp sword do not deprive anyone of life; the sword merely passes through the space between the seven bodies. There are these fourteen hundred, principal kinds of generation, and sixty four hundred kinds, and six hundred kinds; there are five hundred kinds of action, and five kinds of action, and action and half-action; there are sixty-two ways, sixty-two sub-classes, six classes, eight planes of man, forty-four hundred kinds of livelihood, forty-nine hundred kinds of wanderers, forty-nine hundred [518] abodes of serpents, twenty hundred faculties, thirty hundred hells, thirty-six elements of dust, seven pericentral breeds, seven non-pericentral breeds, seven sheathless breeds, seven kinds of gods, seven kinds of men, seven kinds of demons, seven lakes, seven knots, seven kinds of chasms, seven hundred kinds of dreams, seven kinds of dreams, seven hundred kinds of dreams; and there are eighty-four hundred thousand great aeons wherein, by running and wandering through the round of rebirths, fools and the wise both will make an end of suffering. There is none of this: ‘By this virtue or observance or asceticism or holy life I shall make unripened action ripen or annihilate ripened action as it comes.’ Pleasure and pain are meted out.

The round of rebirths is limited, there is no shortening or extending it, no increasing or decreasing it. Just as a ball of string when thrown goes as far as the string unwinds, so too, by running and wandering through the round of rebirths, fools and the wise both will make an end of suffering."

17. "About this a wise man considers thus: This good teacher holds this doctrine and view: ‘There are these seven bodies... fools and the wise both will make an end of suffering.’ If this good teacher’s words are true, then here [in this teaching] I have done [my duty] by not doing [it], here I have lived [the holy life] by not living [it]. Both of us are exactly equal here [in this teaching]; both have arrived at equality, yet I do not say that both of us will make an end of suffering by running and wandering through the round of rebirths. But it is superfluous for this good teacher to go about naked, to be shaven, to exert himself in the squatting position, and to pull out his hair and beard, since I, who live in a house crowded with children, who use Benares sandalwood, who wear garlands, scents, and ungents, and accept gold and silver, shall reap exactly the same destination, the same future course, as this good teacher. What do I know and see that I should lead the holy life under this teacher? So when he finds that this way negates the living of the holy life, he turns away from it and leaves it.

18. "This is the fourth way that negates the living of the holy life that has been declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, accomplished and fully enlightened."

19. "These, Sandaka, are the four ways that negate the living of the holy life that have been declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, accomplished and fully enlightened. [519] wherein a wise man certainly would not live the holy life, or if he should live it, would not attain the true way, the Dhamma that is wholesome."

20. "It is wonderful, Master Ananda, it is marvellous, how the four ways that negate the living of the holy life have been declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, accomplished and fully enlightened... But, Master Ananda, what are those four kinds of holy life without consolation that have been declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, accomplished and fully enlightened, wherein a wise man certainly would not live the holy life, or if he should live it, would not attain the true way, the Dhamma that is wholesome?"

21. "Here, Sandaka, some teacher claims to be omniscient and all-seeing, to have complete knowledge and vision thus:
`Whether I am walking or standing or sleeping or awake, knowledge and vision are continuously and uninterruptedly present to me.' He enters an empty house, he gets no alms-food, a dog bites him, he meets with a wild elephant, a wild horse, a wild bull, he asks the name and clan of a woman or a man, he asks the name of a village or a town, and the way to go there. When he is questioned: 'How is this?' he replies: 'I had to enter an empty house, that is why I entered it. I had to get no alms-food, that is why I did not get any. I had to be bitten by a dog, that is why I was bitten. I had to meet with a wild elephant, a wild horse, a wild bull, that is why I met with them. I had to ask the name and clan of a woman or a man, that is why I asked. I had to ask the name of a village or a town and the way to go there, that is why I asked.'

22. "About this a wise man considers thus: This good teacher claims to be omniscient and all-seeing, to have complete knowledge and vision. When he is questioned: "How is this?" he replies: "I had to... that is why I asked." So when he finds that this holy life is without consolation, he turns away from it and leaves it.

23. "This is the first kind of holy life without consolation that has been declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, accomplished and fully enlightened," wherein a wise man certainly would not live the holy life, or if he should live it, would not attain the true way, the Dhamma that is wholesome.

24. "Again, Sandaka, here a certain teacher is a traditionalist, one who regards oral tradition as truth, he teaches a Dhamma by oral tradition, by legends handed down, by what has come down in scriptures. But when a teacher is a traditionalist, one who regards oral tradition as truth, some is well remembered and some is wrongly remembered, some is true and some is otherwise.

25. "About this a wise man considers thus: This good teacher is a traditionalist...some is true and some is otherwise.' So when he finds that this holy life is without consolation, he turns away from it and leaves it.

26. "This is the second kind of holy life without consolation that has been declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, accomplished and fully enlightened...

27. "Again, Sandaka, here a certain teacher is a reasoner, an inquirer. He teaches a Dhamma hammered out by reasoning, following a line of inquiry as it occurs to him. But when a teacher is a reasoner, an inquirer, some is well reasoned and some is wrongly reasoned, some is true and some is otherwise.

28. "About this a wise man considers thus: This good teacher is a reasoner... some is true and some is otherwise." So when he finds that this holy life is without consolation, he turns away from it and leaves it.

29. "This is the third kind of holy life without consolation that has been declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, accomplished and fully enlightened...

30. "Again, Sandaka, here a certain teacher is dull and confused. Because he is dull and confused, [521] when he is asked such and such a question, he engages in verbal wriggling, in oral-wriggling; 'I don't say it is like this. And I don't say it is like that. And I don't say it is otherwise. And I don't say it is not so. And I don't say it is not not so.'

31. "About this a wise man considers thus: This good teacher is dull and confused...[thus] he engages in verbal wriggling, in oral-wriggling... So when he finds that this holy life is without consolation, he turns away from it and leaves it.

32. "This is the fourth kind of holy life without consolation that has been declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, accomplished and fully enlightened...

33. "These, Sandaka, are the four kinds of holy life without consolation that have been declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, accomplished and fully enlightened, wherein a wise man certainly would not live the holy life, or if he should live it, would not attain the true way, the Dhamma that is wholesome."

34. "It is wonderful, Master Ananda, it is marvellous, how the four kinds of holy life without consolation have been declared by the Blessed One who knows and sees, accomplished and fully enlightened... But, Master Ananda, what does that teacher assert, what does he declare, wherein a wise man certainly would live the holy life, and while living it would attain the true way, the Dhamma that is wholesome?"

35-42. "Here, Sandaka, a Tathāgata appears in the world, accomplished, fully enlightened... (as Sutta 51, §§12-19)... he purifies his mind from doubt.

43. "Having thus abandoned these five hindrances, imperfections of the mind that weaken wisdom, quite secluded from
sensual pleasures, secluded from unwholesome states, he enters upon and abides in the first jhāna, which is accompanied by applied and sustained thought, with rapture and pleasure born of seclusion. A wise man certainly would live the holy life with a teacher under whom a disciple attains such a lofty distinction, [522] and while living it he would attain the true way, the Dhamma that is wholesome.

44-46. “Again, with the stilling of applied and sustained thought, he enters upon and abides in the second jhāna...With the fading away as well of rapture...he enters upon and abides in the third jhāna...With the abandoning of pleasure and pain...he enters upon and abides in the fourth jhāna. A wise man certainly would live the holy life with a teacher under whom a disciple attains such a lofty distinction...

47. “When his concentrated mind is thus purified, bright, unblemished, rid of imperfection, malleable, widy, steady, and attained to imperturbability, he directs it to knowledge of the recollection of past lives. He recollects his manifold past lives, that is, one birth, two births...[as Sutta 51, §24]...Thus with their aspects and particulars he recollects his manifold past lives. A wise man certainly would live the holy life with a teacher under whom a disciple attains such a lofty distinction...

48. “When his concentrated mind is thus purified, bright, unblemished, rid of imperfection, malleable, widy, steady, and attained to imperturbability, he directs it to knowledge of the passing away and reappearance of beings...[as Sutta 51, §25]...Thus with the divine eye, which is purified and surpasses the human, he sees beings passing away and reappearing, inferior and superior, fair and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate, and he understands how beings pass on according to their actions. A wise man certainly would live the holy life with a teacher under whom a disciple attains such a lofty distinction...

49. “When his concentrated mind is thus purified, bright, unblemished, rid of imperfection, malleable, widy, steady, and attained to imperturbability, he directs it to knowledge of the destruction of the taints. He understands as it actually is: ‘This is suffering’...[as Sutta 51, §26]...He understands as it actually is: ‘This is the way leading to the cessation of the taints.’

50. “When he knows and sees thus, his mind is liberated from the taint of sensual desire, from the taint of being, and from the taint of ignorance. When it is liberated there comes the knowledge: ‘It is liberated.’ He understands: ‘Birth is destroyed, the holy life has been lived, what had to be done has been done, there is no more coming to any state of being.’ A wise man certainly would live the holy life with a teacher under whom a disciple attains such a lofty distinction, and while living it he would attain the true way, the Dhamma that is wholesome.”

51. “But, Master Ānanda, when a bhikkhu is an arahant with taints destroyed, one who has lived the holy life, done what had to be done, laid down the burden, reached the true goal, destroyed the sinner of being, and is completely liberated through final knowledge, [523] could he enjoy sensual pleasures?”

“Sanda, when a bhikkhu is an arahant with taints destroyed...and is completely liberated through final knowledge, he is incapable of transgression in five cases. A bhikkhu whose taints are destroyed is incapable of deliberately depriving a living being of life; he is incapable of taking what is not given, that is, of stealing; he is incapable of indulging in sexual intercourse; he is incapable of knowingly speaking falsehood; he is incapable of enjoying sensual pleasures by storing them up as he did formerly in lay life. When a bhikkhu is an arahant with taints destroyed...he is incapable of transgression in these five cases.”

52. “But, Master Ānanda, when a bhikkhu is an arahant with taints destroyed...is his knowledge and vision that his taints are destroyed continuously and uninterruptedly present to him whether he is walking or standing or sleeping or awake?”

“As to that, Sandaka, I shall give you a simile, for some wise men here understand the meaning of a statement by means of a simile. Suppose a man’s hands and feet were cut off. Would he know ‘My hands and feet are cut off’ continuously and uninterruptedly, whether he is walking or standing or sleeping or awake, or would he know ‘My hands and feet are cut off’ only when he reviews this fact?”

“The man, Master Ānanda, would not know ‘My hands and feet are cut off’ continuously and uninterruptedly, rather, he would know ‘My hands and feet are cut off’ only when he reviews this fact.”

“So too, Sandaka, when a bhikkhu is an arahant with taints destroyed...his knowledge and vision that his taints are...
destroyed is not continuously and uninterruptedly present to him whether he is walking or standing or sleeping or awake; rather, he knows 'My taints are destroyed' only when he reviews this fact. 78

53. "How many emancipated ones are there in this Dhamma and Discipline, Master Ananda?"

"There are not only one hundred, Sandaka, or two hundred, three hundred, four hundred or five hundred, but far more emancipated ones than that in this Dhamma and Discipline."

"It is wonderful, Master Ananda, it is marvellous! There is no lauding of one's own Dhamma and no disparaging of the Dhamma of others; there is the teaching of the Dhamma in its full range, [524] and so many emancipated ones appear. But these Ajivakas, those mothers' dead sons, laud themselves and disparage others, and they recognise only three emancipated ones, namely, Nanda Vaccha, Kisa Sankicca, and Makkhal Gosi."

54. Then the wanderer Sandaka addressed his own assembly: "Go, sirs. The holy life is to be lived under the recluse Gotama. It is not easy for us now to give up gain, honour, and renown."

That is how the wanderer Sandaka exhorted his own assembly to live the holy life under the Blessed One.
The emphatic *yeva*, “just,” implies that he was clinging to material form, feeling, etc., misconceived to be “I,” “mine,” and “my self.” With the arising of vision—a metaphorical expression for the path of stream-entry—personality view is eradicated and he understands the aggregates to be mere empty phenomena devoid of the selfhood that he had earlier imputed to them.

“These” refers to the five aggregates.

**Sutta 76**

748 *Tiracchānaśakha*. Many translators render this expression as “animal talk.” However, *tiracchāna* means literally “going horizontally,” and though this term is used as a designation for animals, MA explains that in the present context it means talk that goes “horizontally” or “perpendicularly” to the path leading to heaven and liberation.

749 The “four ways that negate the living of the holy life” (*ubhaya-karmādhyakṣaṇā*, lit. “ways that are not living the holy life”) are teachings that in principle nullify the prospect of attaining the ultimate fruits of spiritual discipline. As the sutta will show, their proponents—inconsistently with their own principles—did observe celibacy and practise austerity. The “four kinds of holy life without consolation” (*anassa-sikti brahmācariyaṇa*) do not undermine the principles of the holy life, but they also fail to offer the prospect of attaining the ultimate fruits of spiritual discipline.

750 The following passage makes explicit the materialist premises of the nihilistic view already set forth at MN 60.7. The *Sūkhāvatīya Sutta* ascribes this view to Ajīta Kesakambalin (DN 2.23/1.55).

751 The point seems to be that even if one does not live the holy life, one ultimately reaps the same rewards as one who does, as the rest of the passage will make clear.

752 In the *Sūkhāvatīya Sutta* the view that follows, as far as “the space between the seven bodies,” is ascribed to Pakudha Kaccāyana (DN 2.26/1.56). However, in that sutta the following passage on the elaborate system of classifications, down to “fools and the wise both will
make an end of suffering,” is connected with the view of non-causality and follows immediately upon the statement of the doctrine of non-causality set forth in this sutta at §13. The entire view is there assigned to Makkhali Gosāla. Since there are evident connections between the non-causality doctrine and items in the system of classifications (e.g., the reference to the “six classes”), and since both are known to have been typical of the Ațjivaka movement headed by Makkhali Gosāla, it seems that the inclusion of this system of classifications here under the doctrine of the seven bodies came about through an error of oral transmission. The correct version would thus be the one preserved by the Dīgha Nikāya. For the commentary on the system of classification, see Bodhi, The Discourse on the Fruits of Reclusihood, pp. 72–77.

This statement reafirms the fatalistic view of liberation enunciated in §13.

This is the claim made by the Jain teacher the Nigamtha Nātapaṇṭa at MN 14:17, and both the latter and Pāṇaṇa Kassaṇa at AN 9:28/iv.428–29. The fact that he makes bad judgements and must ask questions belies his claim to omniscience.

MA: This position is called cāl-wriggling (anamottikkepa) because the doctrine roams about here and there, like an cāl diving in and out of the water, and thus it is impossible to catch hold of it. In the Saṅghakhaṭa Sutta this position is ascribed to Saṅgha Belaṅhiputta (DN 2.32/1.58–59). It is quite possible that the “cāl-wrigglers” were a class of radical sceptics who questioned the entire prospect of apodictic knowledge about ultimate issues.

MA: He is incapable of storing up food provisions and other pleasures for themselves and subsequently enjoying them.

At DN 29.26/iii.133 four other things that the arahant cannot do are mentioned: he cannot take a wrong course of action because of desire, hatred, fear, or delusion.

The translation of this passage follows the BBS etc.

Nīyāṭhiro: Nīn had rendered this as “guides,” Horner as “great leaders.” Evidently both followed PED, which takes nīyāṭhāra to be an agent noun related to nīyāṭh (ka), pilot or helmsman. But nīyāṭhāra must be an agent noun of

the verb nīyāṭh (to go out (to final emancipation),” and thus it has been rendered here as “emancipated one.”

On these three mentors of the Ațjivakas, see MN 36.5 and 383. MA explains the phrase putamatiṇa puttā, “mother’s dead sons,” thus: The idea occurred to him, “The Ațjivakas are dead; their mother had dead sons.”

SUTTA 77

761 Anāgatam vādapatthi. Nīn had translated: “a future logical consequence of an assertion.” The meaning seems to be that the Buddha understands all the unexpressed implications of his own doctrine as well as of his opponents’ doctrines. The phrase may also imply that, in such suttas as the Brahmāvāda Sutta, the Buddha has laid down a critique applicable to any doctrine that might arise in the future course of religio-philosophical thought.

762 Explained in full in MN 10. The first seven groups of “wholesome states” (§§15–21) constitute the thirty-seven requisites of enlightenment (bodhipakkhiṇa dhamma).

763 Abhijñānaśaṅkhaṇamippaṭa. MA explains as the attainment of arahantship. This may be the only sense that the word pārami bears in its appearance in the four Nikāyas. In the later Theravāda literature, beginning perhaps with such works as the Dhammapada, this word comes to signify the perfect virtues that a bodhisatta must fulfill over many lives in order to attain Buddhahood. In that context it corresponds to the parami of the Mahāyāna literature, though the numerical lists of virtues overlap only in part.

764 MA explains liberation (nīyāṭh) here as meaning the mind’s full (but temporary) release from the opposing states and its full (but temporary) release by delighting in the object. The first liberation is the attainment of the four jhanās using a kasina (see §24 and n.768) derived from a coloured object in one’s own body; the second is the attainment of the jhanās using a kasina derived from an external object; the third can be understood as the attainment of the jhanās through either a very pure and beautiful coloured kasina or the four brahmavihāras. The